Indo-European *men- and *tel-

Allan R. Bomhard
Charleston, SC

1. *men- ~ *mon- ~ *mn̥- '(vb.) to desire passionately, to yearn for; (n.) ardent desire, passion, lust'

All of the standard Indo-European etymological dictionaries contain an entry for a root *men- 'to think, to remember' (cf. Rix 1998:391—393; Pokorny 1959:726—728; Walde 1927—1932.II:264—266; Watkins 1985:41; Mann 1984—1987:755, 756, 757, 758, 769—770, 770, 778, 779, 780, 781, 795, 796). There are a number of verbal forms with meanings such as 'to desire passionately or eagerly, to yearn for, to hope or wish for' and related nominal forms having meanings such as 'passion, desire, wish, love, etc.' that are traditionally considered to be derivatives of this root — these include: Tocharian B *mañu* 'desire', A *mnu* 'spirit, appreciation, desire' (< Proto-Tocharian *mäñäu- 'desire' < Proto-Indo-European *men-eu̯- 'desire'); Sanskrit *man-* (RV) 'to hope or wish for' (also 'to think'), *mánas-* 'spirit, passion' (also 'mind, intellect, perception, sense'), *manasyú-* (RV) 'wishing, desiring', *manā́* (RV) 'devotion, attachment, zeal, eagerness', *manīṣita-* (MBh) 'desired, wished (for); desire, wish', *manyú-* (RV) 'high spirit or temper, ardor, zeal, passion'; Greek μενεαίνω 'to desire earnestly or eagerly', μένος 'spirit, passion', μέμονα (perfect used as present) 'to desire or wish eagerly, to yearn for, to strive for', μενοινή 'eager desire', μενοινάω 'to desire eagerly'; Old Irish *menn-* 'to desire', *menme* 'feeling, desire' (also 'mind, intelligence'); Welsh *mynnu* 'wish, will', *mynnwys* 'desired'; Cornish *mynnes* 'will'; Middle Breton *mennat* (Modern Breton *mennout*) 'to wish, to desire'; Old English *myne* 'desire, love, affection' (also 'memory'), *mynle* 'desire', *mynelic* 'desirable'; Old High German *minna* 'love' (New High German [poetical] *Minne* 'love'), *minnōn*, *minneōn* 'to love'; Dutch (poetical) *minne* 'love', *beminnen* 'to love'; Old Saxon *minnea*, *minnia* 'love'; Old Frisian *minne* 'love' (according to Feist [1939:193, under Gothic *ga-minþi*], the Old High German, Dutch, Old Saxon, and Old Frisian forms are from Proto-Indo-European *meni̯ā);[1] Old Icelandic *muna* 'to like, to long for', *munaðr* 'delight', *munr* 'love', *munuð* or *munúð* 'pleasure, lust' (cf. De Vries 1977:395 and 396); Norwegian *mun* 'pleasure, enjoyment'. Clearly, all of these forms belong together, and, clearly, none of them has anything whatsoever to do with thinking or remembering. Consequently, I propose that these forms be separated out from Proto-Indo-European *men- 'to think, to remember' and assigned to a new, heretofore unrecognized root, *men- '(vb.) to desire passionately, to yearn for; (n.) ardent desire, passion, lust'. Thus, Proto-Indo-European had two distinct roots, identical in form

---

[1] Kluge—Seebold (1989:480) proposes derivation of the Old High German, Old Saxon, and Old Frisian forms from Proto-Indo-European *mi-n-, itself derived from a root *mei- 'to desire, to love', and compares the Germanic forms with several forms from Celtic and Baltic. This proposal seems far less likely than the traditional derivation from *men- since it does not account for the Old English and Old Icelandic cognates.

but different in meaning. Several of the derivatives of these two roots have fallen together.

2. *tel- ~ *tol- ~ *tl̥-/*tl- 'to leave, to let go'

The Sanskrit root *ric-* (< Proto-Indo-European *lei̯kʷ-*) has a wide range of meanings, including 'to empty, to evacuate, to leave, to give up, to resign; to release, to set free; to part with; to leave behind, to take the place of (acc.), to supplant; to separate or remove (abl.)', (passive) 'to be emptied; to be deprived of or freed from (abl.); to be destroyed, to perish', (causative) 'to make empty, to discharge, to emit; to abandon, to give up'. With nasal infix, this root yields Pali *riñcati* 'to leave behind' and Kashmiri *rinzun* 'to escape, to flee away secretly'. Cognates of this widely-attested root in other Indo-European daughter languages have an equally broad range of meanings: cf., for example, Greek λείπω 'to leave, to quit; to leave behind, to leave at home; to leave, to forsake, to abandon', (passive) 'to be left, to be left behind'; Latin (with nasal infix: Proto-Indo-European *linkʷ-*) *linquō* 'to leave, to abandon, to forsake, to depart from': Old Irish *léicid* 'to let loose, to let fly, to let go, to dismiss'; Armenian *lkʰanem* 'to leave'; Lithuanian *liẽkas* 'that which is left over', *liẽkana* 'remainder, remnant'; Old Lithuanian (3rd sg.) *liẽkti* 'to leave, to remain' (inf. *lìkti*). Cf. Rix 1998:365—366; Pokorny 1959:669—670; Walde 1927—1932.II:396—397; Mann 1984—1987:674, 695, 696; Watkins 1985:36. Particularly important here is the semantic development found in Kashmiri.

Now, the Germanic forms for 'to flee' are usually considered have no known cognates in other Indo-European languages — these forms include: Gothic *þliuhan* 'to flee', **unþa-þliuhan* 'to escape', *þlauhs* 'flight'; Old Icelandic *flýja* 'to flee, to take flight', *flugr* 'flight', *flótti* 'flight' (cf. De Vries 1977:134); Norwegian *flya* 'to flee'; Old English *flēon* 'to fly from, to flee, to escape', *flyht* 'flying, flight', *flēam* 'flight'; Old Frisian *fliā* to flee'; Old High German *fliohan* 'to flee' (New High German *fliehen* 'to flee, to run away, to escape'). According to Onions (1966:361), the Common Germanic forms are to be reconstructed as follows: *þleuχan, *þlauχ, *þluʒum, *þloʒan-.[2] These forms point to a Proto-Indo-European extended stem *tl-eu̯- (with root in zero-grade, suffix in full-grade), itself a derivative from an unextended root *tel- ~ *tol- ~ *tl̥-. This unextended root may be preserved in Hittite: *dal(iy)a-* (3rd sg. pres. *da-a-la-iz-zi*) 'to leave, to leave behind, to let alone, to let go' (cf. Friedrich 1991:205—206; Kronasser 1966.1:547). We can join the Hittite and Germanic forms by assuming that Hittite retained the original meaning and that the Germanic forms developed semantically along the same lines as Kashmiri *rinzun* 'to escape, to flee away secretly' cited above. This comparison allows to posit a new Proto-Indo-European root, *tel- ~ *tol- ~ *tl̥-/*tl- 'to leave, to let go'.

---

[2] I agree with Buck's (1949:697—698, §10.51) comment that "[t]he view that Goth. *þl-* is from *fl-* and so the whole group connected with that for 'fly' (ON *flūga*, etc. 10.37), as Zupitza, Gutt. 131, is generally rejected. But there was much later confusion between the two groups."

References

Adams, Douglas Q. 1999. *A Dictionary of Tocharian B*. Amsterdam & Atlanta, GA: Editions Rodopi.

Buck, Carl Darling. 1949. *A Dictionary of Selected Synonyms in the Principal Indo-European Languages*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

De Vries, Jan. 1977. *Altnordisches etymologisches Wörterbuch [Old Norse Etymological Dictionary]*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.

Ernout, Alfred & Antoine Meillet. 1979. *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue latine: Histoire des mots [Etymological Dictionary of the Latin Language: History of Words]*. 4th edition. Paris: Klincksieck.

Feist, Sigmund. 1939. *Vergleichendes Wörterbuch der gotischen Sprache [Comparative Dictionary of the Gothic Language]*. 3rd edition. Leiden: E. J. Brill.

Friedrich, Johannes. 1991. *Kurzgefaßtes hethitisches Wörterbuch [Short Hittite Dictionary]*. Reprint of the 1952 edition (without modifications) together with the supplements. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

Kluge, Friedrich & Walther Mitzka. 1967. *Etymologisches Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache [Etymological Dictionary of the German Language]*. 20th edition. Berlin & New York, NY: Walter de Gruyter.

————————— & Elmar Seebold. 1989. *Etymologisches Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache [Etymological Dictionary of the German Language]*. 22nd edition. Berlin & New York, NY: Walter de Gruyter.

Kronasser, Heinz. 1966. *Etymologie der hethitischen Sprache [Etymology of the Hittite Language]*. Vol. 1. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Lehmann, Winfred P. 1986. *A Gothic Etymological Dictionary*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.

Mann, Stuart E. 1984—1987. *An Indo-European Comparative Dictionary*. Hamburg: Helmut Buske Verlag.

Mayrhofer, Manfred. 1956—1980. *Kurzegefaßtes etymologisches Wörterbuch des Altindischen [Short Etymological Dictionary of Old Indic]*. 4 volumes. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

Onions, C. T., ed. 1966. *The Oxford Dictionary of English Etymology*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Pokorny, Julius. 1959. *Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch [Indo-European Etymological Dictionary]*. Bern: Francke Verlag.

Puhvel, Jaan. 1984— . *Hittite Etymological Dictionary*. Berlin, New York, NY, Amsterdam: Mouton de Gruyter.

Rix, Helmut. 1998. *Lexikon der indogermanischen Verben [Lexicon of Indo-European Verbs]*. Wiesbaden: Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag.

Van Windekens, A. J. 1976—1982. *Le tokharien confronté avec les autres langues indo-européennes [Tocharian Compared with the Other Indo-European Languages]*. 3 vols. Louvain: Centre International de Dialectologie Générale.

Walde, Alois. 1927—1932. *Vergleichendes Wörterbuch der indogermanischen Sprachen [Comparative Dictionary of the Indo-European Languages]*. Revised and edited by Julius Pokorny. 3 vols. Reprinted 1973. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.

Walde, Alois & Johann Baptist Hofmann. 1938—1956. *Lateinisches etymologisches Wörterbuch [Latin Etymological Dictionary]*. 3 vols. 5th ed. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

Watkins, Calvert, ed. 1985. *The American Heritage Dictionary of Indo-European Roots*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Company.

[To appear in the Festschrift for William R. Schmalstieg, edited by Philip Baldi.]